

A Real Little Game: The Pinocchio Effect in Pervasive Play



JANE M^CGONIGAL

Department of Theater and Performance Studies / Center for New
Media

University of California at Berkeley, USA

A Real Little Game: The Pinocchio Effect in ~~Pervasive~~ Play



Perverse-ive

JANE M^CGONIGAL

Department of Theater and Performance Studies / Center for New
Media

University of California at Berkeley, USA

A Real Little Game: The Pinocchio Effect in ~~Pervasive~~ Play



Perverse-ive

(from the root word
“perverse,”
meaning, “not
good,” as in
“perverting
proper values
or practices”

JANE M^CGONIGAL

Department of Theater and Performance Studies / Center for New
Media

University of California at Berkeley, USA

WHAT THE HECK IS PERVERSIVE PLAY?*

*not yet found in any of the taxonomies, typologies or frameworks of
Espen Aarseth, et al.

M^CGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

WHAT THE HECK IS PERVERSIVE PLAY?*

Pervasive

+

Immersive

=

Perv-ersive

*not yet found in any of the taxonomies, typologies or frameworks of Espen Aarseth, et al.

M^CGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

WHAT THE HECK IS PERVERSIVE PLAY?*

Pervasive

+

Immersive

=

Perv-ersive

The “-ive” is important; it implies transformation

*not yet found in any of the taxonomies, typologies or frameworks of Espen Aarseth, et al.

M^CGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

CATEGORIES OF UBIQUITOUS PLAY

Pervasive gaming

Immersive gaming

Pervasive

McGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

CATEGORIES OF UBIQUITOUS PLAY

Pervasive gaming

Immersive gaming

Pervasive

Mobile play in everyday spaces

- Mixed reality; mobile, embedded, and location aware technologies
- LOCAL scale
- Typically multiplayer, competitive play
- Noderunner, Botfighters, geocaching, *Can You*



The Whirling Dervishes: Flash mobbing downtown San Francisco

See Me Now? flash
McGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

CATEGORIES OF UBIQUITOUS PLAY

Pervasive gaming

Immersive gaming

Pervasive

A genre of pervasive play that denies its gameness

- A.K.A. “unfiction,” “alternate reality gaming”
- Blurred boundaries, no metacommunications: “This is not a game”
- Everyday technologies
- GLOBAL scale
- Usually massively multiplayer, collective play required
- The Beast, *Push*, *Nevada*,



“Shhh ... it’s a secret that we’re playing a game.”

MCGONIGAL Acheron MetaCortex Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

CATEGORIES OF UBIQUITOUS PLAY

Pervasive gaming

Immersive gaming

Pervasive

Any kind of pervasive or immersive play

that makes non-players nervous

MCGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

CATEGORIES OF UBIQUITOUS PLAY

Pervasive gaming

Immersive gaming

Perversive

Any kind of pervasive or immersive play

that makes non-players nervous

What makes people nervous?

- Games that are too sprawling (too pervasive)*
- Games that are too realistic (too immersive)*
- Games that are too persuasive (too credible)*

*perhaps these “perverting influences” are the “dark underbelly” of play that Brian Sutton Smith and Eric Zimmerman want us to explore?

MCGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

**...LEST YOU THINK I AM MERELY IMAGINING
THIS PROBLEM...**

(The Top 10 Comments about Perversive Play)

MCGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

**...LEST YOU THINK I AM MERELY IMAGINING
THIS PROBLEM...**

(The Top 10 Comments about Pervasive Play)

10. “You surely have encountered concern about the social effects of pervasive gaming ... What about players who can’t distinguish between the game and the real world anymore?” – *Industry Leaders: An interview with Sven Hallen (It’s Alive Games)*

MCGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

**...LEST YOU THINK I AM MERELY IMAGINING
THIS PROBLEM...**

(The Top 10 Comments about Pervasive Play)

10. “You surely have encountered concern about the social effects of pervasive gaming ... What about players who can’t distinguish between the game and the real world anymore?” – *Industry Leaders: An interview with Sven Hallen (It’s Alive Games)*

9. “They invade your life and summon you to play even when you are offline ... It’s not always easy to tell reality from fiction. Scary stuff.”- BBC News Online

MCGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

**...LEST YOU THINK I AM MERELY IMAGINING
THIS PROBLEM...**

(The Top 10 Comments about Pervasive Play)

10. “You surely have encountered concern about the social effects of pervasive gaming ... What about players who can’t distinguish between the game and the real world anymore?” – *Industry Leaders: An interview with Sven Hallen (It’s Alive Games)*

9. “They invade your life and summon you to play even when you are offline ... It’s not always easy to tell reality from fiction. Scary stuff.” - BBC News Online

8. “Some players become so 'immersed' in the games that they forget that it is a game [...] public policies may become necessary to protect players from what we might consider ‘dangerously immersive’ games.” – a legal paper at the 31st annual Telecommunications Policy &

MCGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

**...LEST YOU THINK I AM MERELY IMAGINING
THIS PROBLEM...**

(The Top 10 Comments about Pervasive Play)

7. “Players may find themselves experiencing an existential doubt – is it real, or is it immersive media?... That's the thing about games without frontiers. You never really know when you're playing.” – *Steven Johnson, Slate magazine*

MCGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

**...LEST YOU THINK I AM MERELY IMAGINING
THIS PROBLEM...**

(The Top 10 Comments about Pervasive Play)

7. “Players may find themselves experiencing an existential doubt – is it real, or is it immersive media?... That's the thing about games without frontiers. You never really know when you're playing.” – *Steven Johnson, Slate magazine*

6. “In countries like Austria or Switzerland, they like the game, but they don't dare launch it. They feel it might be dangerous.” – Sven Hallen, *It's Alive Games*

McGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

**...LEST YOU THINK I AM MERELY IMAGINING
THIS PROBLEM...**

(The Top 10 Comments about Pervasive Play)

7. “Players may find themselves experiencing an existential doubt – is it real, or is it immersive media?... That's the thing about games without frontiers. You never really know when you're playing.” – *Steven Johnson, Slate magazine*

6. “In countries like Austria or Switzerland, they like the game, but they don't dare launch it. They feel it might be dangerous.” – Sven Hallen, *It's Alive Games*

5. “Do we really want a nation full of people who think that everything is a clue or some kind of invitation to play? At best, that seems vaguely annoying. At worst, it sounds like widespread paranoia. Why would we want games that encourage such a

McGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com
dangerous and disruptive rejection of reality?” – participant in a pervasive play workshop at Intel's 2002 “The Meaning of Place” Forum

**...LEST YOU THINK I AM MERELY IMAGINING
THIS PROBLEM...**

(The Top 10 Comments about Perversive Play)

4. “Have you considered the fact that there are actual mental illnesses with exactly the same behaviors and thinking patterns as the players of the kind of games you’re talking about? Wouldn’t you agree that what the gamers are calling play is really just varying degrees of psychosis?” – audience Q & A at the Melbourne Digital Arts & Culture 2003 conference attendee

MCGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

**...LEST YOU THINK I AM MERELY IMAGINING
THIS PROBLEM...**

(The Top 10 Comments about Perversive Play)

4. “Have you considered the fact that there are actual mental illnesses with exactly the same behaviors and thinking patterns as the players of the kind of games you’re talking about? Wouldn’t you agree that what the gamers are calling play is really just varying degrees of psychosis?” – audience Q & A at the Melbourne Digital Arts & Culture 2003 conference attendee

3. “The important question is: Do these games just tend to attract people who are already prone to mental illness, or do they make them crazy from scratch?” - participant in an 030303: Collective Play Colloquium breakout session

MCGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

**...LEST YOU THINK I AM MERELY IMAGINING
THIS PROBLEM...**

(The Top 10 Comments about Perversive Play)

4. “Have you considered the fact that there are actual mental illnesses with exactly the same behaviors and thinking patterns as the players of the kind of games you’re talking about? Wouldn’t you agree that what the gamers are calling play is really just varying degrees of psychosis?” – audience Q & A at the Melbourne Digital Arts & Culture 2003 conference attendee

3. “The important question is: Do these games just tend to attract people who are already prone to mental illness, or do they make them crazy from scratch?” - participant in an 030303: Collective Play Colloquium breakout session

2. “They seem to be some kind of schizophrenia machine, designed specifically to induce a mental breakdown.” colleague at the University of

MCGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

**...LEST YOU THINK I AM MERELY IMAGINING
THIS PROBLEM...**

(The Top 10 Comments about Perversive Play)

1. “It sounds just like *Ender’s Game*.” – too many people to name

MCGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

WHAT WE HAVE HERE IS A PROBLEM.



Perverse play: an inevitable descent into madness?

MCGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

WHAT WE HAVE HERE IS A PROBLEM.



Perverse play: an inevitable descent into madness?

If a game is

too sprawling (too pervasive);

too realistic (too immersive);
or

too persuasive (too credible),

PLAYERS WILL BELIEVE IN THE GAME TOO MUCH FOR THEIR OWN GOOD. They will either

Be fooled into thinking a game is “real life”, OR

MCGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

...BUT DON'T BLAME THE CRITICS OR THE ACADEMICS
Players enthusiastically contribute to the perception of perversity:

“You find yourself at the end of the game, waking up as if from a long sleep. Your marriage or relationship may be in tatters. Your job may be on the brink of the void, or gone completely. You may have lost a scholarship, or lost or gained too many pounds [...] Yet now here we are, every one of us excited at blurring the lines between story and reality. The game promises to become not just entertainment, but our lives.”



Follow the footsteps... ephemeral clues embedded in everyday spaces.

MCGONIGAL player of the Beast Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

...BUT DON'T BLAME THE CRITICS OR THE ACADEMICS



“The words ‘THIS IS NOT A GAME’ in the closing credits has me concerned about our involvement with this game. I’ve been toying with the idea lately, with all the ideological specs going on, that the game is a little closer to home than a lot of us realized, expected, or are willing to accept [...]. The more we gather and learn about this fictitious world, the more uneasy I become [...]. I’m disturbed to think that, one day, possibly sooner than we think, this game may become more real than we ever imagined.”-*from a player-written editorial published on*

MCGONIGAL the first central immersive gaming Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

...BUT DON'T BLAME THE CRITICS OR THE ACADEMICS

Former immersive gamers have attempted to “game” real life crimes and tragedies:*

- 9/11
- Washington, D.C. sniper attacks
- East Coast USA serial pet killer

**for a fuller discussion of this phenomenon, see “This Is Not a Game: Immersive Aesthetics and Collective Play” (McGonigal 2003)*

McGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

...BUT DON'T BLAME THE CRITICS OR THE ACADEMICS

Former immersive gamers have attempted to “game” real life crimes and tragedies:

- 9/11
- Washington, D.C. sniper attacks
- East Coast USA serial pet killer

Prompting other players to turn the rhetoric of immersive play back on itself:

"The Cloudmakers were a 'collective detective' for a *game*. Remember that. It was scripted. There were clues hidden that were gauged for us. It was *narrative*.... *This is not a game.* Do not go getting delusions of grandeur. [We] solved a story. This is real life."

"The references to this as a 'puzzle' and the thought that this group could 'solve' this make me sick. Even if the people posted with good intention. This is not a game." (*Cloudmakers message board posts from 9/12-9/14/2001*)

McGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

...BUT DON'T BLAME THE CRITICS OR THE ACADEMICS

How do you succeed in the "Go Game"?

From player interviews (7/03 – 10/03):

“See the game everywhere, even where it isn't.”

“Assume everyone's part of the game until they tell you they're not, and even then, you just have to refuse to believe them.”

“Follow the signal. If you lose the signal, turn all of the noise around you into a signal and pretend it means something and

then don't let anyone tell you



Is this man part of the game, or not?

MCGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

...BUT DON'T BLAME THE CRITICS OR THE ACADEMICS

How do you succeed in the "Go Game"?

From player interviews (7/03 – 10/03):

“My team practices playing in real life, we try to see everything around us as a clue [...] A lot of what you fool around with in the real games turns out not to be the game anyway, so I think there isn't much difference between playing real games and just playing in real life [...] except that the real games end and the

pretend ones can go on



Random papers left behind, or important clue?

MCGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

...BUT DON'T BLAME THE CRITICS OR THE ACADEMICS

How do you succeed in the "Go Game"?

From player interviews (7/03 – 10/03):

"What game? We're not playing a game."



How could something this interesting NOT be a part of the game?

Players wonder what, if anything, they are supposed to do with the giant

troll.

MCGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

A BRIEF HISTORY OF THE CREDULOUS SPECTATOR



Digital projection: An earlier "pervasive" art form?

- Collective hysteria at screenings of Lumière's short documentary *The Arrival of a Train at the Station* (1895)

- Historical distrust of emerging mimetic arts and immersive media as "deceptive arts" that "pose a threat to consciousness and perception" and, through their hyperpersuasiveness may be used as "vehicles for mass propaganda with unprecedented and inexorable success" (See Oliver Grau's 2003 *Virtual Art: From Illusion to Immersion*)

MCGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

STAGING AN INTERVENTION

Performance theorist Richard Schechner proposes that there are two kinds of play: “make believe” and “make belief”

- “**make believe**” carefully protects the boundaries between what is real and what is pretended;
- “**make belief**” intentionally blurs them.

Using this dichotomy, Schechner frames the issue of performance, play and belief as a question of reflexivity: “**To what degree does a person believe her own performance?**”

M^CGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

STAGING AN INTERVENTION

“I believe that you can reach the point where there is no longer any difference between developing the habit of pretending to believe and developing the habit of believing.” –the narrator in Umberto Eco’s *Foucault’s Pendulum*

My arguments:

- There is an essential and stubborn distinction between an intentional *performance* of belief and belief itself.

M^CGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

STAGING AN INTERVENTION

“I believe that you can reach the point where there is no longer any difference between developing the habit of pretending to believe and developing the habit of believing.” –the narrator in Umberto Eco’s *Foucault’s Pendulum*

My arguments:

- Contemporary gamers of immersive and pervasive entertainment *affect* a powerful credulity — “This is not a game” — in the course of pervasive play, but do not actually suffer from this credulity.

McGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

STAGING AN INTERVENTION

“I believe that you can reach the point where there is no longer any difference between developing the habit of pretending to believe and developing the habit of believing.” –the narrator in Umberto Eco’s *Foucault’s Pendulum*

My arguments:

- The widely assumed credulity and so-called “psychological susceptibility” of immersive and pervasive gamers is, in fact, a strategic performance on the part of the players.

McGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

STAGING AN INTERVENTION

“I believe that you can reach the point where there is no longer any difference between developing the habit of pretending to believe and developing the habit of believing.” –the narrator in Umberto Eco’s *Foucault’s Pendulum*

My arguments:

- It is my goal to prevent the mistake we as researchers will be making if we fail to recognize the conscious, goal-oriented and pleasurable nature of this affected belief – let alone the very fact that it is affected.

McGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

WHAT IS A “PERFORMANCE OF BELIEF”?

Suspension of disbelief is:

- solitary,
- Passive, and
- Internal.

Performance of belief is:

- Social,
- active, and
- External.



To be accepted into the magic circle of play, we must perform our belief in the game to other players.

McGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

WHAT IS THE PINOCCHIO EFFECT?

Pinocchio is first and foremost a story of desire. It is the desire of the artificial to become real, of the “play object” (a puppet) to become life itself, “a real little boy.”

Pervasive and immersive play is first and foremost the *desire* of gamers for their virtual play experiences to become real, and for real life to become a “real little game.”

McGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

WHAT IS THE PINOCCHIO EFFECT?

Pinocchio is first and foremost a story of desire. It is the desire of the artificial to become real, of the “play object” (a puppet) to become life itself, “a real little boy.”

•*How do we reconcile the emotional “truth” and “real” affective impact of games with their virtual status?* ←

•*How can we own our virtual successes as part of our real identity?*

Pervasive and immersive play is first and foremost the *desire* of gamers for their virtual play experiences to become real life, and for real life to become a “real little game.”

McGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

WHAT IS THE PINOCCHIO EFFECT?

Pinocchio is first and foremost a story of desire. It is the desire of the artificial to become real, of the “play object” (a puppet) to become life itself, “a real little boy.”

- *Confidence*
- *Agency*
- *Permission*
- *Clear objectives and procedures for action*
- *Feedback*
- *Community*

Pervasive and immersive play is first and foremost the *desire* of gamers for their virtual play experiences to become real, and for real life to become a “real little game.”

McGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

WHAT IS THE PINOCCHIO EFFECT?

Pinocchio is first and foremost a story of desire. It is the desire of the artificial to become real, of the “play object” (a puppet) to become life itself, “a real little boy.”

Pervasive and immersive play is first and foremost the *desire* of gamers for their virtual play experiences to become real, and for real life to become a “real little game.”

The generation of this desire to believe in the permeability of the game-reality boundary, a desire that is NEVER FULFILLED, is the Pinocchio Effect.

McGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com

www.avantgame.com

M^CGONIGAL Contact: janemcg@uclink.berkeley.edu www.avantgame.com